

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PUBLIC HEARING dated  
AUGUST 3, 2018**

*Project:* **PROPOSED MANILA HARBOUR CENTRE RECLAMATION PROJECT**  
*Project Proponent:* **CITY GOVERNMENT OF MANILA**  
*Project Location:* **BARANGAY 128, TONDO, MANILA**  
*Venue of the Activity:* **BRIDGE OF HOPE SCHOOL (SOCIAL HALL), BARANGAY 128,  
TONDO, MANILA**

<b>PARTY WHO RAISED THE ISSUE / SECTOR REPRESENTED</b>	<b>CONCERN / ISSUE</b>	<b>RESPONSE / Responding Party</b>
<p><b>1. Ms. Angie Aguas from PPA Head Office</b></p>	<p>She wants to know if the project is aligned with the sustainable developmental plan of Manila Bay.</p>	<p><b>Ms. Malou Gutierrez (PHILKAIROS):</b></p> <p>Ms. Malou answered that when the proponent consulted NEDA, the said agency don't have the sustainable master plan yet. She said that they just don't know with the City of Manila if they have a separate plan for the sustainable development of Manila Bay.</p> <p><b>Ms. Cristina L. Echon (City of Manila):</b></p> <p>Ms. Echon, representative of the City of Manila stated that, it is the City Planning who is in-charge of the project and that they have a program for sustainable development.</p> <p>An anonymous representative from P.R.A. also stated that, with regard to the Manila Bay sustainable master planning by NEDA, they have decided to get all this proposed reclamation and to not just incorporate but also to include in the study</p>

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PUBLIC HEARING dated  
AUGUST 3, 2018**

*Project:* **PROPOSED MANILA HARBOUR CENTRE RECLAMATION PROJECT**  
*Project Proponent:* **CITY GOVERNMENT OF MANILA**  
*Project Location:* **BARANGAY 128, TONDO, MANILA**  
*Venue of the Activity:* **BRIDGE OF HOPE SCHOOL (SOCIAL HALL), BARANGAY 128,  
TONDO, MANILA**

		of the master plan of Manila Bay.
<p><b>2. Atty. Armi Corpuz, Office of the Sen. Cynthia Villar</b></p>	<p>The inquirer asked who were the communities that were invited or included in the list of invitees in the conduct of public scoping.</p> <p>They also express that they are very concern with reclamation projects because of its people-damage effect. First, it damages the area which will be reclaimed. Second, the source of the filling material. In this reclamation, the proponent would be getting the filling materials from the San Nicolas Shoal where such still hasn't have an ECC yet. Third is the community, the reclaimed land is always higher than the natural level of the land and this will worsen the flooding in the area. Also, the Supreme court have issued</p>	<p><b>Ms. Malou Gutierrez (PHILKAIROS):</b></p> <p>Said that they have followed the DENR guidelines in conducting the public scoping, which include the host barangay - Bgry. 128, all the sectoral representatives and neighboring barangays. Also, the agencies having the decision over the process of this application.</p> <p><b>Ms. Malou Gutierrez (PHILKAIROS):</b></p> <p>Ms. Malou answered that the primary source of the filing material will be from the San Nicolas Shoal. But the proponent is required to present a proposed alternative source of the filling material. She mentioned that the proponent is considering the estuary in Orion, Bataan and dredge materials from the side of Pampanga. Regarding with the deterioration of the area, they are not presenting the project as a solution for the problem of the Manila Bay. The proponent has conducted a feasibility study and will</p>

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PUBLIC HEARING dated  
AUGUST 3, 2018**

**Project:** PROPOSED MANILA HARBOUR CENTRE RECLAMATION PROJECT  
**Project Proponent:** CITY GOVERNMENT OF MANILA  
**Project Location:** BARANGAY 128, TONDO, MANILA  
**Venue of the Activity:** BRIDGE OF HOPE SCHOOL (SOCIAL HALL), BARANGAY 128, TONDO, MANILA

	<p>a continuing mandamus for the clean-up of Manila Bay.</p> <p>She also wants to ask the DENR-EMB regarding the issuance of area clearance before they apply for an ECC.</p>	<p>also be subjected to evaluation of different agencies. That is why they are conducting this kind of exercise for the stakeholders to see how will this mutually benefit the community.</p> <p><i>Comment regarding to the issue of continuing mandamus issued by the Supreme Court:</i>  <b>Ms. Cristina L. Echon (City of Manila):</b>  The representative will rely this to the city legal for clarifications.</p> <p><b>DENR – EMB:</b>  The agency involved in the public hearing will consider the suggestions of Atty. Corpuz in the review process.</p> <p>The DENR pursuant to DAO 2018-14, requires new projects and projects that are still on the review process that the proponent needs to secure all the requirements for an area clearance and then will be issued with a notice to proceed to review the EIA and application for ECC.</p>
<p><b>3. Kag. Baby of Brgy. 128</b></p>	<p>Her question is, will the project affect the existing buildings in their</p>	<p><b>Ms. Malou Gutierrez (PHILKAIROS):</b></p>

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PUBLIC HEARING dated  
AUGUST 3, 2018**

*Project:* **PROPOSED MANILA HARBOUR CENTRE RECLAMATION PROJECT**  
*Project Proponent:* **CITY GOVERNMENT OF MANILA**  
*Project Location:* **BARANGAY 128, TONDO, MANILA**  
*Venue of the Activity:* **BRIDGE OF HOPE SCHOOL (SOCIAL HALL), BARANGAY 128,  
TONDO, MANILA**

	<p>community especially when the “Big one” earthquake happens.</p>	<p>Replied that it is stated in the DENR guidelines that they have to address on how to mitigate or lessen the posible effects of such calamity. She said that the idea here is, how the people can survive such situations. That is why the preparers have consulted PHILVOCS on the effects of earthquake. Such considerations are included in the study.</p>
<p><b>4. Mr. Jon Relox from BFAR</b></p>	<p>Considering that there are numerous phytoplankton present in the area, can the preparers include in their assessment of the water body the fishery resource of the area?</p>	<p><b>Ms. Julie Ann Butron (Marine team):</b></p> <p>Ms. Julie explained that it is the same with the corals, they have assumed that there are no more fishing activities present in that area.</p> <p><b>Ms. Malou Gutierrez (PHILKAIROS):</b></p> <p>Ms. Malou said that they have consulted the BFAR head and she suggested that the proponent and the City of Manila could consider rehabilitating an area outside the industrial area.</p>
<p><b>5. Andrew Macalalag, Kabataang Sambayanang Kristyano</b></p>	<p>The representative asked if the proponent have any proposed plans and what area the facilities they are planning to build? Also, will the proponent respect</p>	<p><b>Engr. Sangalang, R-II Builders:</b></p> <p>Engr. Sangalang said that they are only planning on building warehouses. Also,</p>

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PUBLIC HEARING dated  
AUGUST 3, 2018**

*Project:* **PROPOSED MANILA HARBOUR CENTRE RECLAMATION PROJECT**  
*Project Proponent:* **CITY GOVERNMENT OF MANILA**  
*Project Location:* **BARANGAY 128, TONDO, MANILA**  
*Venue of the Activity:* **BRIDGE OF HOPE SCHOOL (SOCIAL HALL), BARANGAY 128,  
TONDO, MANILA**

	<p>adhering to their environmental consent and concern?</p>	<p>like what they have mentioned earlier, they are going to comply on all national government rules and regulations. Besides, after the project is done, there will be a Multi-partite team composed of and headed by EMB and then the proponent and the concerned barangay. The proponents will do all possible mitigations to protect the environment.</p> <p><b>Ms. Malou Gutierrez (PHILKAIROS):</b></p> <p>Ms. Malou mentioned that, in addition to their application, is only for the reclamation process. The sources of filing materials will also be evaluated if they have their own environmental compliance certificate.</p> <p><b>Mr. Carl Santiago, DENR – EMB:</b></p> <p>Mr. Carl clarified what Engr. Benny Sangalang have said about MMT, the EMB and proponent are not part anymore of the MMT pursuant to DAO 2017-15. It will be headed by the LGU – MENRO or an agency that has mandate related to the project. Also,</p>
--	---	---

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PUBLIC HEARING dated  
AUGUST 3, 2018**

*Project:* **PROPOSED MANILA HARBOUR CENTRE RECLAMATION PROJECT**  
*Project Proponent:* **CITY GOVERNMENT OF MANILA**  
*Project Location:* **BARANGAY 128, TONDO, MANILA**  
*Venue of the Activity:* **BRIDGE OF HOPE SCHOOL (SOCIAL HALL), BARANGAY 128,  
TONDO, MANILA**

		to clarify, the application is just for the 50-hectare reclamation project. Any vertical development within the area will be applied to a different ECC and the same with the source of filling material, they will have their separate ECC.
<b>6. Kag. Eduardo Langkay, Brgy. 105</b>	Said that the project is near their barangay community, activities that will be conducted in the project area concerned their people. They are worried about the safety of the people in their community.	<b>Ms. Malou Gutierrez (PHILKAIROS):</b>  Ms. Malou explained that they have already considered all the vessel basic safety requirement together with the policy of the Philippine Coast Guard and Philippine Navy. Regarding the behavior of the waves, they have an expert on tidal modeling who studies the behavior of the water. It is coordinated with the engineering department for the proper engineering design.
<b>7. Maria Clarinda Mendoza, ComSec of the Senate Committee on Environment and Natural Resources</b>	Ms Mendoza asked, with regards to the concern of Brgy. 105, what assurance does these communities surrounding the project area have incase any incidents happen? Any assistance from the proponent, local or national agencies and government?	<b>Ms. Cristina L. Echon (City of Manila):</b>  Ms. Echon replied that Mayor Erap responds to any kind of calamity. Also, DSWD will provide any help that they need.  <b>Engr. Benny Sangalang, R-II Builders:</b>  Engr. Sangalang replied that in case of any

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PUBLIC HEARING dated  
AUGUST 3, 2018**

*Project:* **PROPOSED MANILA HARBOUR CENTRE RECLAMATION PROJECT**  
*Project Proponent:* **CITY GOVERNMENT OF MANILA**  
*Project Location:* **BARANGAY 128, TONDO, MANILA**  
*Venue of the Activity:* **BRIDGE OF HOPE SCHOOL (SOCIAL HALL), BARANGAY 128,  
TONDO, MANILA**

		<p>emergency or calamity, they believe that the proponent will not neglect those who are affected. First of all, for humanitarian reason, in times of calamities expect that there will be help coming form the proponent especially when proven that it is because of the project.</p>
<p><b>8. Atty. Armi Corpuz, Office of the Sen. Cynthia Villar</b></p>	<p>Atty. Corpuz mentioned that there is what we call “environmental guarantee fund” included in the EIA or ECC. How do the agency or proponent compute for that and how will the people claim for that? Who determines the amount and what are the mechanics to avail that fund?</p>	<p><b>Mr. Carl Santiago, DENR – EMB:</b></p> <p>Mr. Carl explained that the EMF and EGF are declared in the ECC, section 8 or 9. The public will be aware of this because it is stated in the EIS. The amount is replenishable and it has a separate bank account for the EMF and EGF respectively. The EMF will be intended for the MMT of the project.</p> <p><b>Ms. Elizabeth Mendoza, PRA:</b></p> <p>Ms Mendoza mentioned that, the environmental guarantee fund is specific for the environmental damages and restoration. But also, there is this all-risk insurance that will cover all accidents, people and property, and everything that is covered</p>

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PUBLIC HEARING dated  
AUGUST 3, 2018**

*Project:* **PROPOSED MANILA HARBOUR CENTRE RECLAMATION PROJECT**  
*Project Proponent:* **CITY GOVERNMENT OF MANILA**  
*Project Location:* **BARANGAY 128, TONDO, MANILA**  
*Venue of the Activity:* **BRIDGE OF HOPE SCHOOL (SOCIAL HALL), BARANGAY 128,  
TONDO, MANILA**

		<p>by this. And she thinks that this is the answer to the concerns of the people about the accidents within the periphery caused by the project.</p> <p><b>Mr. Carl Santiago, DENR – EMB:</b></p> <p>For additional information, Mr. Carl mentioned that, per DENR guidelines, the proponent will establish the environmental guarantee fund.</p>
<p><b>9. Kag. Albin Salamat, Brgy. 128</b></p>	<p>His concern is the flooding in their area, because the water will overflow and flood our community. They are bothered by the presence of fecal coliform in our bodies of water. This also means that the drinking water in their community are also contaminated. They hope that the proponent will allocate social development project or social responsibility component. If possible, regulate or rehabilitate the area, at the same time the project will continue leaving the community with a clean environment.</p>	<p><b>Ms. Malou Gutierrez (PHILKAIROS):</b></p> <p>Ms. Malou expresses that they will consider the suggestion regarding the social development program. As for the explanation, it is considered in the study the methodology on how to prevent and avoid these types of calamity. The main role of EIA is to determine and mitigate the effects of geo-hazards, including the flooding of area.</p>
<p><b>10. Ms. Jane Galleto, PPA</b></p>	<p>Ms. Galleto asked that, once the project has been issued or has been granted with an ECC and the</p>	<p><b>Mr. Carl Santiago, DENR – EMB:</b></p>



**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PUBLIC HEARING dated  
AUGUST 3, 2018**

*Project:* **PROPOSED MANILA HARBOUR CENTRE RECLAMATION PROJECT**  
*Project Proponent:* **CITY GOVERNMENT OF MANILA**  
*Project Location:* **BARANGAY 128, TONDO, MANILA**  
*Venue of the Activity:* **BRIDGE OF HOPE SCHOOL (SOCIAL HALL), BARANGAY 128,  
TONDO, MANILA**

	<p>proponent is the City of Manila, will they be the one in-charge of the monitoring the compliance of conditions stipulated in the ECC?</p> <p>She also mentioned that the monitoring will commence in the start of the project implementation until the operational phase. Until such time that it is operational, is it still the MMT who will monitor the conditions of the ECC?</p>	<p>Mr. Carl explained that the EMB will be the one to monitor. They will have a table monitoring and site monitoring. There will be also a submission of compliance monitoring report. Semi-annual submission of CMR and CMVR. Technically, when the ECC is released an MMT will be formed and will prepare the CMVR. The proponent also will submit a compliance monitoring report semi-annually in the Central Office. Also, a self monitoring report or SMR, which will be submitted by the proponent quarterly on EMB-NCR.</p> <p>Mr. Carl replied yes.</p>
--	--	---