

PUBLIC HEARING REPORT
PROPOSED SCRAP RECYCLING MINI MILL PROJECT
SteelAsia Manufacturing Corporation

05 October 2018; 10:00 a.m.

Brgy. San Francisco Basketball Court, Brgy. San Francisco, Concepcion, Tarlac

1. Invitations

Formal written invitations were issued before the scheduled date. Invitations sent were duly acknowledged, received and forwarded to the persons concerned. Provided below is the list of invitees.

GOV. SUSANA A. YAP
Governor
Province of Tarlac

HON. CARLITO CASADA DAVID
Vice Governor
Province of Tarlac

HON. ANDRES D. LACSON
Mayor
Municipality of Concepcion

HON. DANILO D. DAVID
Vice Mayor
Municipality of Concepcion

SANGGUNIANG BAYAN NG CONCEPCION

- SB CARLA BAUTISTA
- SB ATTY. JOEY BALUYUT
- SB ANTONIO CANONO
- SB ANTONIO VILLANUEVA
- SB GEORGE FELICIANO
- SB REGIDO DIZON
- SB MANUEL BONDOC
- ABC EVELYN RIVERA

HON. BRGY. CHAIRMAN ROMEO FELICIANO AND COUNCIL
Brgy. Telabanca

HON. BRGY. CHAIRMANBONG RIVERA AND COUNCIL
Brgy. San Vicente

HON. BRGY. CHAIRMAN MARIO DAVID AND COUNCIL
Brgy. Dungan

HON. BRGY. CHAIRMAN LEOPOLDO B. MANALO AND COUNCIL
Brgy. San Nicolas Balas

HON. BRGY. CHAIRMAN JAYSON LAGMAN AND COUNCIL
Brgy. San Francisco

BRGY. CHAIRMAN EDWIN NARCISO AND COUNCIL
Brgy. Alfonso Concepcion Tarlac

BRGY. CHAIRMAN BIENVENIDO FELICIANO AND COUNCIL
Brgy. San Nicolas Poblacion

MA. ELIZABETH BASILIO
Municipal Planning and Development Officer (MPDO)

MR. GILBERT BASILIO
Municipal Environment and Natural Resources Office (MENRO)

ENGR. MARCIANO SANTIAGO
Municipal Engineering Office

RD LORMELYN CLAUDIO
Regional Director
Environmental Management Bureau Region III

MS. EMELITA P. LINGAT
Provincial Environmental and Natural Resources Office (PENRO) – Tarlac

MR. CALVIN SARIDA
One Balen Concepcion
San Jose, Concepcion, Tarlac

MR. NOEL VILLANUEVA
3rd District Representative
Concepcion, Tarlac

ATTY. MAILA MATIC
Matic Law office
Brgy. San Nicolas Poblacion, Concepcion Tarlac

MR. DAN MICLAT
Pastor Association
Concepcion, Tarlac

PARISH PASTORAL COUNCIL IMMACULATE CONCEPCION

PARISH RENEWAL EXPERIENCE (PREX)

OFFICE OF THE SCHOOL DIVISION SUPERINTENDENT

MR. JESS TADEO
Brgy. Councilor
Brgy. Green Village Concepcion, Tarlac

MR. SATURNINO MANDAL
3rd District Provincial Board Member
Province of Tarlac

MR. VERNON VILLANUEVA
3rd District Provincial Board Member
Province of Tarlac

MR. HENRY CRUZ
3rd District Provincial Board Member
Province of Tarlac

NGOs/POs – or associations of senior citizens, tricycle drivers, cooperatives

Residents of Barangay Telabanca, San Vicente, San Nicolas Balas, San Francisco, San Antonio, Dungan, San Nicolas Poblacion

Shown in ANNEX A is the list of duly received invitations and few invitations actually received by the invitee.

2.0 Publication

The Notice of Public Hearing was published on September 19 and 26. Provided below is the Affidavit of Publication.

Malaya
Business Insight

People's Independent Media, Inc.

652 Sto. Tomas St., Intramuros, Manila
Tel. Nos. 527-1841 * 527-7242

REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINE)
CITY OF MANILA) S.S.

AFFIDAVIT OF PUBLICATION

I, **Mitchell M. Encarnado**, Filipino of legal age, married and residing at No. 1131 Prudencio St., Sampaloc, Manila after having been duly sworn to in accordance with law, depose and say:

That I am the Advertising Director of Malaya Business Insight, a daily newspaper published, edited and printed in Metro Manila and circulated nationwide, from Monday to Friday with editorial and business offices at 652 Sto. Tomas St., Intramuros, Manila.

That the attached copy of notice of public hearing from EMB,
re: proposed Scrap Recycling Mini-Mill Project of SteelAsia Manufacturing Corp.,

was published in Malaya Business Insight in its issue/s

September 19 & 26, 2018

In witness whereof, I signed this affidavit in
Manila Philippines, this 26th day of Sept. 2018.


MITCHELL M. ENCARNADO
Affiant

Subscribed and Sworn to before me this 26th day
of Sept. 2018, in Manila, Philippines, affiant
exhibiting to me his Res. Cert. No. 15612981
issued at Manila on Jan. 23, 2018.


ATTY. VICENTE C. CRUZ
Notary Public

Until Dec. 31, 2019
PTR No. 5520630
Issued at Quezon City, Jan. 3, 2018
Roll No. 33952/NC-NP No. 003
IBP. Lifetime Member No. 02322

Republic of the Philippines
Department of Environment and Natural Resources
ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT BUREAU
DENR Compound, Visayas Avenue, Diliman Quezon City 1116
Telephone Nos.: (632) 927-1517, 928-3725; Fax No.: (632) 920-2258
Website: <http://www.emb.gov.ph>

NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING

On the ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT (EIS) of the proposed SCRAP RECYCLING MINI-MILL PROJECT of STEELASIA MANUFACTURING CORPORATION in the BARANGAY TELEBANCA, MUNICIPALITY OF CONCEPCION, TARLAC

Notice is hereby given to all parties who wish to give their opinion regarding the proposed SCRAP RECYCLING MINI-MILL PROJECT to attend a Public Hearing on **5 October 2018 (FRIDAY)** at **10:00 AM** (registration starts at 9:00 am) to be held in **BRGY. SAN FRANCISCO BASKETBALL COURT, CONCEPCION, TARLAC.**

The Public Hearing is being conducted in connection with the review of the EIS of the aforementioned project by the Environmental Management Bureau (EMB) of the Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR).

The proposed project will cover the construction and operation of 1,200,000 MTPY rebar and wire rod mill with a new generation scrap recycling mini-mill. Scrap recycling will produce billets and ultimately, rebars which is an input to countless uses, such as building and construction of houses, infrastructure and different concrete works.

All interested parties who wish to attend or participate in this Public Hearing should preferably confirm their attendance/participation and may give their opinion(s) in a concise position paper to the ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT AND MANAGEMENT DIVISION (EIAMD) of this Office through mail or through email at eiamd.emb.gov.ph, three (3) days before the Public Hearing schedule. Those who will not be able to register or submit written positions may be given the opportunity to share their issues on the day of the hearing itself.

The project's EIS and Executive Summary for the Public are downloadable at our website: www.eia.emb.gov.ph (kindly access the Notice of Public Hearing/Consultation link found in our website) while copies will be available in this Office and in the following offices:

- 1) **EMB Region III**
Turquoise Street, Ramar Village, San Agustin, City of San Fernando, Pampanga
- 2) **Municipal Planning and Development Office (MPDO)**
Municipality of Concepcion, Province of Tarlac

For more details, please contact EIAMD Division of this Office at telephone number (02) 920-2240 to 41 and look for the project case handlers **Mr. Carl Louie Santiago** and **Engr. Lenon Ramboyoung.**

Malaya - Sept. 19 & 26, 2018

Doc. No. 191
Page No. 39
Book No. III
Series of 2018

1. Postings/Announcements

Announcements were also posted in conspicuous areas as shown in the photographs below:









2. Program

A. Registration

Registration started as early as 9:00 am while the Program started at 10:00 am. 116 persons attended the Public Hearing. **The attendance sheets are given in ANNEX B.**

B. Presentation

EMB Central Office Representative and Project Casehandlers Mr. Carl Louie Santiago and Mr. Lenon Ramboyong facilitated the Public Hearing. Brief presentation on project background, description, location, implementation schedule and other information or facts regarding the project was provided by the SAMC Representatives. Result of the EIA on impacts, measures and commitments was provided by the EIA Preparer's Team leader Ms. Medi Fernando. Copy of the program is provided in Table 1 below while presentation materials are attached as **Annex C.** –

**Table 1: Program
PROGRAM**

TIME	PROGRAM OF ACTIVITIES	PERSON RESPONSIBLE
8:30 – 10:00 AM	Registration	SAMC/Mediatrix/EMB
10:00 – 10:15 AM	National Anthem	LGU Representative
	Invocation	LGU Representative
	Opening Remarks	LGU Representative
10:15 – 10:30 AM	Introduction on the Conduct of the Public Hearing/Consultation and Target Objective/Outcome Presentation of House Rules on the conduct of Public Hearing	EMB Central Office Representative Atty. Aime Rodaje Public Hearing Officer
10:30 – 11:15 AM	Brief presentation on project background, description, location, implementation schedule and other information or facts regarding the project Discussion on the results of the EIA study conducted	SAMC EIA Team Mediatrix Business Consultancy
11:15 – 12:15 PM	Open Forum	Atty. Aime Rodaje Public Hearing Officer
12:15 – 1:00PM	Lunch	
1:00 – 2:00 PM	Continuation of Open Forum	Atty. Aime Rodaje Public Hearing Officer
2:00 – 2:15PM	Agreements in Public Hearing/Consultation Open Forum; Summary of issues/concerns/ impacts raised by the public and Response of the Proponent	Atty. Aime Rodaje Public Hearing Officer
2:15 – 2:30 PM	Closing Remarks and Next Steps in the EIA Process	EMB Central Office Representative

Emcee:

MS. CJ HIRRO
Ms. Global Philippines 2016

C. Open Forum

The Open Forum session was moderated and facilitated by the Hearing Officer Atty. Aime Rodaje from Legal Division of EMB Central Office. Public Hearing Guidelines were provided as follows.

Mga PatakaransaPagsasagawa ng Public Hearing:

1. Ang public hearing ay gagawin sa Tagalog. Gayunpaman, maaari pa ring gamitin ang lengguwahe kung saan kayo mas kumportable.
2. Ang sinumang may gustong sabihin sa open forum ay dapat itaas ang kanyang kamay upang mapayagang magsalita ng hearing officer. Ang mga komento at suhestyon ay maaari ding isulat sa ipapamahaging papel at ibigay sa tauhan ng DENR.
3. Gamitin ang mikropono sa pagsasalita sapagkat ang mga pangyayari ay itinatala.
4. Kung magsasalita sa unang pagakataon, sabihin ang pangalan, opisina/organisasyon na iyong nirerepresenta at ang iyong posisyon.
5. Ang mga magsasalita ay dapat bigyan ng kaukulang pansin ang nakalaang oras
 1. Project Proponent – 10 minuto para ipaliwanag ang proyekto
 2. EIA Consultant/PP – 15-20 minuto para ipaliwanag ang mga natuklasan sa kanilang pag-aaral
 3. Stakeholders/Concerned citizen – 2 minuto bawat isa

(ang sinumang gustong magsalita ng mas matagal upang ipresenta ang mga importanteng impormasyon gayundin ang mga nangangailangn ng mga gamit tulad ng projector ay dapat magsab isa hearing officer sa pamamagitan ng EMB personnel bago magsimula ang open forum)

6. Lahat ng presentasyon at katanungan ay dapat maikli, malinaw at direkto. Iwasan ang paggawa ng mahahabang pagsasalita upang magamit ng husto ang partisipasyon ng publiko at upang makamit ang objektib ng public hearing.
7. Ang mga komento ay dapat gawin bilang kinatawan ng interes ng publiko at hindi pansarili ng sagayon ay naka pokus ang lahat sa isyung pinaguusapan.
8. Makinig sa taong nagsasalita at iwasan ang paggawa ng anumang nakakabulabog. Ano man ang nararamdaman tungkol sa sinasabi ng taong nagsasalita ay dapat itong ipagtimpi at hintayin ang pagkakataong makapagsalita. Irespeto ang opinion ng iba at ang hindi pagsang-ayon ay dapat isatinig ng maayos.
9. Ang hearing officer ay may karapatang palabasin ang indibidwal o grupo na patuloy na nakakagulo sa ginagawang hearing kung hindi pa rin ito tumigil matapos bigyan ng tatlong babala ng Hearing Officer.
10. Kung maari ay tapusin ang Public Hearing at huwag munang umalis.

Shown below are the summary of issues and concerns raised.

Table 2: Summary of Issues and Concerns

Issue	By / Affiliation	Response
The zoning reclassification done by the Municipal Council of Concepcion, Tarlac has been disapproved by the Provincial Board of Tarlac. Thus, the ECC public hearing should not proceed as the Province has disapproved the reclassification	Vice Governor Carlito David	The disapproval by the Provincial Board (PB) of Tarlac is legally invalid. In a similar case decided by the Supreme Court (Moday vs. Court of Appeals, G.R. No. 107916, February 20, 1997), such a disapproval was ruled as null and void, as the only ground by which Municipal Council's resolution or ordinance can be disapproved by the Provincial Board is if the same is beyond its (Municipal Council's) authority to enact. The zoning reclassification was well within the authority of the Municipal Council. The Province effectively usurped the powers of the Municipality when it disapproved the latter's Resolution.

<p>The project should be relocated elsewhere, such as in New Clark City, as the Province of Tarlac does not allow heavy industries</p> <p>Concepcion, Tarlac is a purely agricultural community; SteelAsia will just compete with farmers and aquaculturists/fishpond industry for water</p> <p>The Project will affect the community because the Project site is in the downstream area</p> <p>The ECC public hearing should be in a language understood by the local community</p> <p>No consultation conducted in Brgy. Telabanca</p>		<p>Current DENR guidelines on ECC applications state that no other government permits or licenses (which includes zoning reclassifications) are required for the purpose of ECC application processes, which is limited to addressing environmental concerns.</p> <p>The Public Hearing conducted is governed by separate set of laws and Rules, i.e. PD 1586 and its IRR and guidelines. The disapproval of the PB of Tarlac becomes part of the process where every stakeholder is being given his chance to air his concerns.</p> <p>As stated above, the Municipality acted well within its powers in reclassifying land within its boundaries for zoning purposes. A disapproval by the Province of such act constitutes usurpation by the Province of the powers of the Municipality.</p> <p>Steel Asia will source its water requirements from rain water.</p> <p>The stakeholders in the downstream area will not be affected because the project will implement zero effluent/zero discharge system and no resource use competition especially in water use.</p> <p>The Public Hearing was conducted in plain English and Filipino languages and partly in Kapampangan dialect thru Ms. CJ Hirro and Mayor Lacson. The technical presentations were also done in Filipino/Tagalog using the simplest terms that may be understood by the stakeholders except for the technical terms which do not have counterparts in Filipino language.</p> <p>There were several consultations (August 22, 2017; September 2017, May 24, 2018 and October 5, 2018) and household perception survey (March to April 2017) conducted inviting the Barangay Council of Telabanca and its residents. However, no actual consultation was conducted within the barangay of Telabanca because there is no available area where we can conduct the consultation, no community residing there and the area is not accessible to the stakeholders which are all among the requirements of the DAO 2003-30 as amended in choosing the</p>
--	--	---

<p>Parua River is the River near the Project Site and not Sacobia River.</p> <p>According to the Tarlac Urban Physical Development Authority (TUPDA), heavy industries are not allowed</p> <p>The aquatic expert's findings on the Secobia River, particularly on the fish and shrimp species found therein, are erroneous.</p> <p>Inputs from SteelAsia/EIA Team as to soil quality</p>		<p>venue for Public Consultations/Scoping and Hearing.</p> <p>The EIA Team of Mediatrix used Sacobia River as reference in its EIA Report because that is the official name of the body of water being referred to in the area and it is the official name recognized and identified by DENR and NAMRIA. Parua River is just a local term that the residents of the area are using.</p> <p>If TUPDA is not allowing heavy industries (we still need to check is details), the municipality of Concepcion is not barred from having its own comprehensive land use plan (CLUP) which includes heavy industries as per the Local Government Code and TUPDA shall amend its priorities as per the municipality's CLUP.</p> <p>This is not erroneous because the findings presented were actual scientific sampling conducted by our freshwater ecology team who are all from UP with masters and PhD degrees and the species found especially the freshwater giant prawns or <i>Macrobrachium rosenbergii</i> are really present in the area.</p> <p>The Project Site is no longer suitable for agriculture because the lahar deposits of Mount Pinatubo affected the soil conditions and quality. Lahar deposits are predominantly sand (75%) with subordinate silt (18%) and only 3% clay. It has a pH of 4.50. Organic matter content is very low (0.10%) and a total nitrogen content of 0.004%. The phosphorus and potassium contents are 4.3 ppm (Olsen P) and 0.012 me/100g K, respectively. Because of the low nutrient status and low cation exchange capacity (CEC) of only 0.427 me/100g, lahar is considered an inert medium for plant growth and lahar-laden fields have stayed untilled for crop growing. Although several plant species have gradually colonized the areas after the Mount Pinatubo eruption thus adding organic matter to the fields, a lot of soil conditioners are required for the soil to be suitable for agriculture.</p>
<p>Na-meet lahat ng needs ng batas at mga tao ay pabor and konti lang ang kontra, hindi na ba itutuloy ang project?</p>	<p>Pastor Alex Carreon, United in Christ</p>	<p>Engr. Lenon responded; denial or approval</p>
<p>Get consultant, experts para mas maintindihan</p> <p>Will this be beneficial sa bayan? Ang isang industriya ba sa Concepcion? Gusto ba natin ituloy kung lumalabag sila sa batas?</p>	<p>Mr. Amurao</p>	

Jobs – will that be regular jobs? Emission Income of the Plant versus 1,000 direct employees		1,000 regular employees
How safe it is in health	Atty. Maila Matic	No health hazards Will provide the health information from Calaca
Endorses the project for Telabanca and Concepcion	Mayor Andres Lacson, Mayor of Concepcion	
As a Scout and Religious Leader, I am in favour na maitayo ang Steel Asia sa bayan ng Concepcion sa Brgy. Telabanca. What is important ay mabawasan ang unemployment rate natin sa ating bayan. Marami sa ating mga kababayan ang magkakaroon ng trabaho.	BRO. DAN MICLAT Boy scout/ Religious Leader	
Kami ay hindi experto sa safety ng operation ng company sa Air, Water and Land. Kung ito ay mag ooperate na pwede bang ipasara kung ito hazardous sa Environment o Community?	Written Questions	Yes.
As per your presentation your proposed plant building and facilities are “word class” as long as you do not break any laws, your project will be big blessings to our town’s constituents. God bless all of us and more power to Steel Asia.	SIS VENET DELOS REYES AND SIS AURORA MICLAT The Religious Sector	

D. Photo Documentation

Photographs of the Public Hearing are shown below









Video coverage/documentation was also taken. Attached is the full copy.

Prepared by:


MATILDE J. FERNNADO
EIA Preparer

Attested by:

ATTY. AIME RODAJE
Public Hearing Officer